



Management response Viet Nam final evaluation

UN-REDD PROGRAMME TENTH
POLICY BOARD MEETING

25-28 June 2013

Lombok, Indonesia

Management Response

UN-REDD National Programme Final Evaluation

Date of evaluation: October 2012-March 2013

Prepared by: Akiko Inoguchi (FAO), Thomas Enters (UNEP), and Tore Langhelle (UNDP) Reviewed by: Timothy Boyle (UNDP)

Cleared by: Mette Loyche-Wilkie (FAO), Tim Christophersen (UNEP), and Timothy Clairs (UNDP)

Overall comments: The report is useful in helping the UN-REDD Programme to improve its performance. Not only will the comments be helpful for Phase II in Viet Nam, but also for UN-REDD Programmes in other Partner countries.			
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue ¹ :	Management response	Key follow up actions	Responsible party
Adopt more “demand driven” programme implementation and a relationship of service provider and client between the UN-REDD programme and its diverse national stakeholders. This will mean finding ways to reduce or remove institutional disincentives to flexibility among the three UN partner organisations, thereby enhancing the programme’s ability to adapt UN-REDD activities to evolving national requirements. For example, do not set overall budgets for each partner for the full life of the programme; instead allocate funds for specific project activities every year or two years, based on past performance, evolving circumstances and emerging needs. Adapt	Accepted	<p><u>Viet Nam level</u></p> <p>The Phase 2 will be delivered through as consultative processes whenever possible, starting with the project inception workshop, which will be an opportunity for receiving comments on the programme logframe and main activities. [To be addressed in the inception phase of the Phase 2 (within 6 weeks of project launch); and continuously addressed throughout Phase 2.]</p> <p>As for the budget allocation mechanism, from a project operational point of view, particularly in terms of mobilizing HR within UN organizations, indicative annual budget per organizations is required. That said, the governance/management structure of Phase 2 ensures that</p>	All three Participating UN Organizations ²

¹ Recommendations for UN-REDD in Viet Nam, and other countries

² Throughout the document, identified responsible parties for the UN Organizations include all levels of UN organizations at the country, regional offices, and HQs levels, unless otherwise specified.

<p>normative products to provide guidance where this is required but tailor them carefully to specific national and sub-national circumstances.</p>		<p>annual budget allocation is only confirmed and disbursements from the trustee made, on an annual basis.</p> <p>Recommendation on budget allocation procedures already addressed in the Phase 2 governance/management structure in the Programme Document (Chapter 4). The Executive Group will confirm allocations, and ask MPTF Office to make annual disbursements. [Already addressed]</p> <p>The Programme Operational Manual will reflect the principle to review and tailor normative programme procedures as relevant to the sub-national level, where relevant. [By the end of the inception phase of Phase 2(within 1 month of the inception workshop).]</p>	
	<p>Accepted</p>	<p><u>UN-REDD Programme level</u></p> <p>The need to offer delivery structures that are efficient and reduce the transaction costs faced by national counterparts has been recognized by the UN-REDD Programme. This is reflected in the National Programme implementation principles agreed by the three participating UN organizations in 2012, which include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Respect the United National Development Group’s (UNDG) Guidance Note on Joint Programming, which states: <p>“The decision to select one or a combination of fund management options for a joint programme should be based on how to achieve the most effective, efficient and timely implementation, and to reduce transaction costs for national partners, donors and the UN.”</p> • Commit to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Minimizing national counterpart transaction costs 	<p>The UN-REDD Programme Secretariat, supported by the Management Group of the participating UN organisations</p>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Putting the interests of the national counterpart ahead of agency interests - Taking advantage of agencies' comparative advantages in implementation support • Recognise that National Programmes (NP) are country-driven and designed to serve countries REDD+ readiness needs <p>The UN-REDD Programme needs to ensure these principles are applied for all support to countries.</p>	
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 2 ³ :	Management response	Key follow up actions	Responsible party

³ Recommendations for UN-REDD in Viet Nam, and other countries

<p>Adopt a single available and knowledgeable focal point for the three UN organisations that can regularly speak with one voice to government counterparts and other stakeholders involved in REDD+. This can significantly reduce the transaction time imposed on the GoV partner by the three UN partners. It would require these organisations to dedicate time and effort to this harmonisation process, then to exercise the discipline needed to ensure its effectiveness.</p>	Accepted	<p><u>Viet Nam level</u></p> <p>At the higher strategic level, the Resident Coordinator is the given focal point for communicating with donors and the Government. We acknowledge the benefits of a nominated single focal point for working level liaising and coordination, and propose such a focal point among the resident UN personnel in Viet Nam. The focal point will thereafter coordinate internally with the in-country focal points from the participating UN organizations. Agree on the internal principles for the focal point and nomination of UN organization to be first focal point. [By the end of the inception phase of Phase 2(within 1 month of the inception workshop).]</p> <p>Insert communication protocols between government and UN within the Programme Operational Manual (Phase 2), and train new UN personnel on rolling basis. [Insert in Manual, by the end of the inception phase of Phase 2 (within 1 month of the inception workshop), and implement continuously throughout Phase 2.]</p> <p>The UNRC will provide ongoing oversight, ensuring the participating UN organizations are meeting their obligations, UN coordination with the VRO, and will facilitate ongoing monitoring and evaluation of UN-REDD activities in conformity with UN standards [To be addressed continuously throughout Phase 2.]</p>	All three Participating UN Organizations
	Accepted	<p><u>UN-REDD Programme level</u></p> <p>It is recognized that one overall national coordinator of the three UN organizations’ budget allocations under a National Programme is desirable. A recommendation on</p>	The UN-REDD Programme Secretariat, supported by the

		<p>strengthening the role of a single National Programme coordinator will be reflected in the Handbook for implementing National Programmes.</p> <p>The National Programme implementation principles also state that the participating UN organizations, in conjunction with the national counterpart and UNRC, will identify a lead agency for each National Programme. The lead agency will support inter-agency coordination and also be responsible for coordinating communication with government partners</p>	Management Group of the participating UN organisations
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 3⁴:	Management response	Key follow up actions	Responsible party
Vigorously support development of the necessary national capacity for engaging and coordinating a broad, multi-sectoral community of REDD+ participants. The national REDD office and their UN supporters will need to be able to proactively reach out to a wide range of stakeholders and identify incentives for them to engage in REDD+. In the process, they will need to minimise the use of arcane REDD+ jargon and ‘off the shelf’, unadapted REDD+ messages and methods.	Accepted	<p><u>Viet Nam level</u></p> <p>For government agencies/ministries it is proposed that the Phase 2 will leverage more active coordination through the National REDD+ Steering Committee and the government members of the Programme Executive Board, REDD+ Network and other flexible working mechanism, including joint effort with other ministries in the international negotiations [Already addressed through identification of mechanisms in the Phase 2 Programme Document, especially Outcome 1. To be implemented continuously throughout Phase 2.]</p>	All three Participating UN Organizations, particularly UNDP.
		<p>A proper project communications strategy + plan will help to address the communication challenges, as identified. [To be developed by the end of the inception phase of Phase 2 (within 1 month of the inception workshop).]</p>	All three Participating UN Organizations.

⁴ Recommendations for UN-REDD in Viet Nam, and other countries

		<p>For non-government stakeholders, different approaches will be considered as appropriate, keeping in mind that in many instances engagement may be in forms that do not require their cognizance of “engagement in REDD+” as such. Identification of NGOs as potential co-implementing partners and service providers will be considered for Phase 2 implementation. [To be developed by the end of the inception phase of Phase 2 (within 1 month of the inception workshop).]</p> <p>Output 1.3 of Phase 2 will build the capacity of members of the National REDD+ Network. [Already addressed.]</p>	<p>All three Participating UN Organizations.</p>
		<p>Familiar terminology, particularly in Vietnamese or the local languages, will be used to the extent possible. Insert this principle in the Programme Operational Manual, and a list of REDD+ terminology will be produced. [By the end of the inception phase of the Phase 2 (within 1 month of the inception workshop).]</p>	<p>All three Participating UN Organizations</p>
		<p>Review all communication products and services before they are provided and ensure suitable language for different audiences. [To be addressed continuously throughout Phase 2.]</p>	<p>All three Participating UN Organizations, especially UNEP</p>
		<p>Already addressed in Phase 2, Outcome 1 (c.f. above). One specific Output will build the capacity of members of the National REDD+ Network. [Already addressed.]</p> <p>Already mentioned in Phase 2 Programme Document under management and governance structure of the Programme. [Already addressed.]</p>	<p>All three Participating UN Organizations. Within the GoV, the VRO.</p>

	Accepted	<p><u>UN-REDD Programme level</u></p> <p>The UN-REDD Programme will emphasise the need for country support to apply the UN-REDD guidance on stakeholder engagement, including ensuring that National Programmes are designed to build capacity for multi-stakeholder participation.</p> <p>The UN-REDD Participatory Governance Assessment (PGA) is an approach that is being piloted in 4 countries (including Viet Nam) to strengthen multi-stakeholder processes.</p>	The UN-REDD Programme Secretariat, supported by the Management Group of the participating UN organisations
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 4⁵:	Management response	Key follow up actions	Responsible party
Acknowledge the risks inherent to piloting REDD+ activities and establish the mechanisms needed to mitigate and manage these risks and present stakeholders with a balanced appraisal of the risks and benefits of all aspects of REDD+ readiness. Managing expectations in the face of persistent uncertainties is a key imperative.	Accepted.	<p><u>Viet Nam level</u></p> <p>As a measure to mitigate such risks, we will continue to put emphasis on developing institutions and capacity for REDD+ by building on what already exists. Any relevant communication material and consultations will provide information on opportunities, benefits, costs and risks in an objective way. [To be addressed continuously throughout Phase 2.]</p>	All three Participating UN Organizations in Viet Nam.
		<p>Creating no-regrets options for element of REDD+ are currently being discussed with GoV and main REDD+ development partners.</p> <p>Assist government in streamlining the “no-regrets” scenario and principle in its NRAP as appropriate. [To be addressed continuously throughout Phase 2 Outcome 1.]</p>	All three Participating UN Organizations.
		<p>Respecting the piloting nature of REDD+, we aim to make use of existing national features (such as provincial planning frameworks) as much as possible.</p>	All three Participating UN Organizations.

⁵ Recommendations for UN-REDD in Viet Nam, and other countries

		Reference to 'benefit sharing' will be in conjunction with 'cost sharing' in Phase 2 materials and communications. Refrain from discussing REDD+ benefit distribution at the local level, except in reference to specific policies and measures that have secured sources of funds. [To be addressed continuously throughout Phase 2.]	All three Participating UN Organizations.
	Accepted	<p><u>UN-REDD Programme level</u> The UN-REDD Programme is taking action to strengthen its risk management approach. One useful measure to identify and manage potential social and environmental risks is the development of practical ways to apply the UN-REDD Social and Environmental Principles and Criteria (SEPC) as part of the UN organisations' review of National Programmes. The SEPC accompanying Benefit and Risks Tool (BeRT) is currently being reviewed for application as a screening tool.</p> <p><u>It is recognized that managing expectations that can be created by the REDD+ process is also important. The Programme is also undertaking further work to better explain the 'social inclusion' elements of REDD+ Readiness i.e. social benefits, stakeholder engagement and potential contribution of REDD+ to transformative livelihoods.</u></p>	<p>The UN organisations' UN-REDD teams, through the Safeguards Coordination Group and the Management Group</p> <p>UNDP, as the lead agency on social inclusion issues for the UN-REDD Programme</p>
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 5 ⁶ :	Management response	Key follow up actions	Responsible party
Address regional 'leakage' issues through a discrete regional initiative that complements national programmes and other REDD+ readiness initiatives.	<p>Partially accepted</p> <p>Under Phase 2, "regional 'leakage'" as such will not be addressed, but the Phase 2 will retain activities which will</p>	Already addressed in identified relevant interventions under Phase 2, Outcome 6 on "Regional cooperation enhances progress on REDD+ implementation in the Lower Mekong Sub-Region". [Already addressed.]	<p>All three Participating UN Organizations (working on Outcome 6).</p> <p>UN-REDD Policy Board needs to make a decision on the</p>

⁶ Recommendations for UN-REDD in Viet Nam, and other countries

	work on improvement of collaborative regional engagement to improve forest governance and prevent/reduce regional displacement of emissions.		appropriateness of support for regional initiatives
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 6 ⁷ :	Management response	Key follow up actions	Responsible party
Help country-led REDD readiness processes to define the rationale and scope for specific national REDD+ activities, based on clear identification of the national drivers of deforestation and forest degradation. Identify possible national and local level policies and measures that can address these drivers. Carefully gauge the relative costs and benefits of preferred policies and measures and clearly determine different stakeholders’ interests and roles in implementing them.	Accepted	In preparing for Phase 2, and particularly for Outcome 2 (on “The six pilot provinces enabled to plan and implement REDD+ actions”), possible national and local level policies and measures that can address these drivers were identified. A more detailed and consultative planning process for PaMs will take place during Phase 2, based on review of locally-specific drivers and existing PaMs, and respecting the rights of local stakeholders to FPIC. It is noted that planning of such PaMs will first require to raise awareness of the role of PaMs in REDD+ among key national REDD+ stakeholders among government and non-government actors.[By the end of the inception phase of Phase 2 (within 1 month of the inception workshop); at the work planning stage.]	All three Participating UN Organizations
		<u>UN-REDD Programme level</u>	The UN-REDD Programme secretariat and

⁷ Recommendations for UN-REDD in other countries, and for Phase 2 in Viet Nam

		The annotated template for preparing R-PPs (the template for National Programmes which is shared with the World Bank's Forest Carbon Partnership Facility) now provides specific guidance for (i) identifying national drivers of deforestation and degradation (ii) considering policies and measures; and (iii) ensuring stakeholder engagement	principal reviewers in each Participating UN Organization to ensure guidance is fully applied to the preparation of new National Programmes
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 7 ⁸ :	Management response	Key follow up actions	Responsible party
Carry out systematic analysis of the national context. Identify key entry points into existing national policy and sub-national, country specific practices. Define where REDD+ can cost-effectively strengthen the performance of existing policies and measures. Ensure that experience from such existing policies and practices inform national REDD+ programmes.	Accepted	Within the Phase 2, and particularly under Outcome 2 (c.f. above) where PaMs will be identified, careful attention will be given to build on existing national/sub-national policies and measures. The design of Phase 2 is based on such an analysis. The inception phase of Phase 2 will validate the analysis. [By the end of the inception phase of Phase 2 (within 1 month of the inception workshop)].	All three Participating UN Organizations
		It is essential to demonstrate workable practices and distill lessons. Combined with further in-depth analysis, policy gaps and weakness are identified and policy changes/ revisions indicated. Enhancing capacity and putting in place implementation mechanism to ensure policy implementation and law enforcement are also needed. [To be addressed continuously throughout Phase 2.]	All three Participating UN Organizations.
		<u>UN-REDD Programme level</u> This recommendation will be incorporated into guidance for the formulation of National Programmes (including the UN-REDD Handbook).	The UN-REDD Programme Secretariat

⁸ Recommendations for UN-REDD in other countries, and for Phase 2 in Viet Nam

Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 8 ⁹ :	Management response	Key follow up actions	Responsible party
Develop robust and comprehensive theories of change and associated results chains for each desired outcome of the national UN-REDD programme. Use well designed consultative processes to ensure the validity of intervention logic and broad stakeholder ownership of the programme.	Accepted	A logical framework analysis has been conducted in preparing for Phase 2. This analysis was validated through a consultation workshop, and will be reviewed in more detail during the inception phase. [By the end of the inception phase of Phase 2 (within 1 month of the inception workshop).]	All three Participating UN Organizations
		The pilot on Participatory Governance Assessment (PGA) in Lam Dong Province focuses on consultative and inclusive approached in a Vietnamese context. Lessons learned from the PGA pilot will inform PGAs in all 6 provinces, but also consultative processes in general. [To be addressed continuously throughout the implementation of Output 5.1 of Phase 2.]	For PGA, UNDP and FAO
		<u>UN-REDD Programme level</u> Greater emphasis is already being applied to the development of measurable impact indicators and the reporting of progress through semi-annual and annual reports. Through the Participatory Governance Assessment process, the UN-REDD Programme is now considering the application of “Institutional Context Analysis” to better determine theories of change. At the global level, this recommendation will be shared with management units in those countries with UN-REDD national programmes.	The UN-REDD Programme Secretariat
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 9 ¹⁰ :	Management	Key follow up actions	Responsible party

⁹ Recommendations for UN-REDD in other countries, and for Phase 2 in Viet Nam

	response		
Ensure that programme communications activities and management arrangements maintain a clear and unequivocal distinction between the emerging national REDD+ programme and the temporary financial and technical assistance provided by UN-REDD.	Accepted	This lesson was learned by the Programme itself and corrective action was taken. The GoV's programme is correctly called the NRAP – National REDD+ Action Programme. List correct terminology and make a clear distinction between the National REDD+ Programme and the Viet Nam UN-REDD Phase 2 Programme, without overemphasizing the importance of the UN-REDD Programme. [By the end of the inception phase of Phase 2 (within 1 month of the inception workshop);To be addressed continuously throughout Phase 2.]	All three Participating UN Organizations
		At the global level, this recommendation will be shared with management units in those countries with UN-REDD national programmes.	At the global level, the UN-REDD Secretariat
Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 10 ¹¹ :	Management response	Key follow up actions	Responsible party
Apply mandatory requirements of UN programmes such as FPIC only after extensive consultation with diverse national and sub-national stakeholders; then carefully adapt mandatory requirements to local circumstances.	Accepted	The mandatory UN requirement for FPIC incorporates extensive consultations with stakeholders and assumes practices will be adapted to local circumstances, as was done for Phase 1. For Phase 2, consultations on the selection of demonstration activities will precede FPIC, under Output 2.3 and Output 2.4UN-REDD Phase 2, Outcome 2 (c.f. above) [To be addressed continuously throughout implementation of Outcomes 2.3, 2.4 of Phase 2.]	All three Participating UN Organizations
		At the global level, UNDP will be asked to review UN-REDD FPIC guidelines in response to this recommendation by the	At the global level, UNDP.

¹⁰ Recommendations for UN-REDD in other countries, and for Phase 2 in Viet Nam

¹¹ Recommendations for UN-REDD in other countries, and for Phase 2 in Viet Nam

		end of 2013.	
--	--	--------------	--