

UN-REDD Social and Environmental Principles and Criteria: comparison of versions 3 and 4

Bold text is used to highlight differences between version 3 and version 4 of the SEPC.

	Version 3 (September 2011)	Version 4 (March 2012)	Explanation
Principle 1	Apply norms of democratic governance, including those reflected in national commitments and multilateral agreements	Apply norms of democratic governance, as reflected in national commitments and Multilateral Agreements	There were comments suggesting changing this to “good” governance. This was the response in the previous consultation: Like “good” governance, democratic governance is concerned with the efficiency of institutions and rules, but also with their fairness and the way they are developed. This has been clarified in the glossary, and is a principle that we are committed to.
Criterion 1	Ensure the integrity and transparency of fiduciary and fund management systems	Ensure the transparency and accountability of fiduciary and fund management systems linked to REDD+ activities	This has been changed to include the concept of accountability. It was felt that ‘integrity’ is promoted by the concept of accountability and transparency. The word accountability has also been defined in the glossary. The link to REDD+ activities has been included to narrow the scope of the criterion.
Criterion 2	Ensure accountability and legitimacy of all bodies representing stakeholders, including through establishing	Ensure legitimacy and accountability of all bodies representing relevant stakeholders, including through establishing responsive feedback	This has been simplified by removing the term ‘complaints’ which was seen to overlap with ‘grievance’. The term ‘relevant stakeholders’ has been included to ensure consistency with other

	responsive national feedback, complaints and grievance mechanisms, among others	and grievance mechanisms	criteria.
Criterion 3	Ensure transparency and accessibility of all information relevant to REDD+, including active dissemination among relevant stakeholders	Ensure transparency and accessibility of all information related to REDD+, including active dissemination among relevant stakeholders	No change. There were a number of comments on further elaboration of accessibility. Accessibility of information is defined in the glossary and includes the concepts of accuracy and linguistically appropriate formats. The UN-REDD FPIC Guidelines goes into further detail on cultural appropriate information sharing and other relevant concepts.
Criterion 4	Ensure the full and effective participation of relevant stakeholders, in particular indigenous peoples and other forest dependent communities, with special attention to the most vulnerable and marginalized group	Ensure the full and effective participation of relevant stakeholders in design, planning and implementation of REDD+ activities, with particular attention to indigenous peoples, local communities and other vulnerable and marginalized groups	This has been changed to 'local communities' for consistency with other criteria and consistency with the Cancun safeguards. A reference to design, planning and implementation is included to reinforce that this criterion should be applied beyond just the design stages.
Criterion 5	Promote coordination, efficiency and effectiveness, including	Promote coordination, efficiency and effectiveness among all	Changed to reflect the comments on the UN's role in law enforcement and the fact that the term

	cooperation across sectors and in the enforcement of laws	agencies and implementing bodies relevant to REDD+¹	'agencies' includes law enforcement agencies as defined in the glossary. A footnote has been included to further highlight the need for attention to cross-scalar coordination and cross-sector coordination.
Criterion 6	Ensure the rule of law and access to justice	Promote and support the rule of law, access to justice and effective remedies²	It was felt that it would difficult for UN-REDD to 'ensure' the rule of law due to factors outside of its control, but it is within its mandate to 'promote and support' the rule of law and its support to countries' REDD+ activities. 'Effective remedies' has been included in order to ensure that attention is paid to finding remedies. The footnote elaborates the need to align with international human rights laws and reinforces that attention is needed for complaints and redress mechanisms targetted at particularly vulnerable groups.

¹ Including cooperation between countries, across different levels of government and with sectors outside the forest sector

² In accordance with international human rights laws and including supporting access to complaints and redress mechanisms for vulnerable and marginalised groups

Principle 2	Respect and protect stakeholder rights, including human rights, statutory and customary rights, and collective rights	Respect and protect stakeholder rights in accordance with international obligations ³	This has been changed to include a reference to international obligations which are promoted by the UN. The footnote further emphasises that rights beyond just statutory rights should be considered.
Criterion 7	Respect and promote the recognition and exercise of equitable land tenure and carbon rights by indigenous peoples and other local communities	Respect and promote the recognition and exercise of the rights of indigenous peoples, local communities and other vulnerable and marginalized groups to land, territories and resources, including carbon	The term equitable has been removed because it was ambiguous in the previous version. The criterion has instead been focused on respecting and promoting rights-based approaches, particularly with regard to certain groups, and taking into account that rights related to lands, territories and resources are more established than rights related to carbon. The inclusion of other vulnerable and marginalised groups is for consistency with other criteria that emphasise certain groups.
Criterion 8	Promote and enhance gender equality, gender equity and	Promote and enhance gender equality, gender equity and	No change.

³ This includes human rights, statutory and customary rights, and collective rights

	women's empowerment	women's empowerment	
Criterion 9	Seek free, prior and informed consent of indigenous peoples and other forest dependent communities and respect and uphold the decision taken (whether consent is given or withheld)	Seek free, prior and informed consent of indigenous peoples and respect and uphold the decision taken (whether consent is given or withheld) ⁴	A footnote is added on the UN-REDD FPIC guidelines, that will, in line with international law, first and foremost apply FPIC to Indigenous Peoples. The guidelines will also clarify the rights of non-indigenous communities in relation to FPIC.
Criterion 10	Ensure there is no involuntary resettlement as a result of REDD+	Ensure there is no involuntary resettlement as a result of REDD+	No change to this criterion. There were some comments suggesting it should be removed because FPIC ensures that this will not happen, but it was felt that it should remain because the revised UN-REDD FPIC Guidelines will, in line with international law, first and foremost apply FPIC to Indigenous Peoples, and this criterion aligns with other safeguards. Further guidance will need to be developed on the practicalities of applying this criterion.
Criterion 11	Respect and protect traditional knowledge and cultural heritage and practices	Respect and protect traditional knowledge, and cultural heritage and practices ⁵	A comma has been added to clarify that 'practices' refers to 'cultural practices'. A footnote has been included to reflect comments on the need to factor in traditional livelihoods and customary use, and to ensure equity in benefits from knowledge.

⁴ In accordance with the UN-REDD Guidelines on FPIC

⁵ Including traditional livelihoods and customary use of forest land and resources, and ensuring that benefits from this knowledge are equitably shared

			There is an issue surrounding the risk that traditional knowledge and practices may not be sustainable. However, specifying that they have to be environmentally sustainable bears risks that such practices/knowledge will be stifled by REDD activities. This issue will need to be dealt with in further guidance
Principle 3	Promote and enhance forests' contribution to sustainable livelihoods	Promote sustainable livelihoods and poverty reduction	We have removed “forests contribution to” here, in order to respond to the concern that the principle could promote increased dependency on forests and distract from possibly necessary efforts to create alternative livelihoods. The term poverty reduction has been included in line with comments. A definition of sustainable livelihoods has been included in the glossary – this includes the notion of natural capital and therefore the links between forests and livelihoods that was in the original text for the principle.
Criterion 12	Ensure equitable, non-discriminatory and transparent benefit sharing and distribution among relevant stakeholders with special attention to the most vulnerable and marginalized	Ensure equitable, non-discriminatory and transparent benefit sharing among relevant stakeholders with special attention to the most vulnerable and marginalized groups ⁶	Footnote to reflect the fact that forest may have more than just a financial value as defined in the glossary.

⁶ Noting that benefits may include both financial and non-financial benefits as defined in the glossary

	groups		
Criterion 13	Protect and enhance, while minimizing adverse impacts on , economic, social and political well-being of relevant stakeholders with special attention to the most vulnerable and marginalized groups	Protect and enhance economic and social well-being of relevant stakeholders, with special attention to the most vulnerable and marginalized groups ⁷	Removed “ while minimizing adverse impacts on”, which is implied in “protect and enhance”. <i>Political</i> (well-being) has been removed, but it has been subsumed within the definition of social well-being in the glossary which was considered to be clearer. The definition in the glossary of economic and social well-being has been altered to include reference to the quality of employment within the economic category. Footnote reinforces that indigenous peoples may have different development perspectives that need to be taken into account.
Principle 4	Contribute to low-carbon, climate-resilient sustainable development policy, consistent with national development strategies, national forest programmes and commitments under international conventions and agreements	Contribute to low-carbon, climate-resilient sustainable development policy, consistent with national development strategies, national forest programmes, and commitments under international conventions and agreements	No change
Criterion 14	Ensure consistency with and contribution to national climate policy objectives, including	Ensure consistency with and contribution to national climate policy objectives, including those	Clarification that this criterion refers to international commitments on climate

⁷ Taking into account indigenous peoples' development visions, concepts and their traditional livelihoods

	mitigation and adaptation strategies and international commitments	of mitigation and adaptation strategies and international commitments on climate	
Criterion 15	Address the risk of reversals of REDD+ achievements, including potential future risks to forest carbon stocks and other benefits to ensure the efficiency and effectiveness of REDD+	Address the risk of reversals of REDD+ achievements, including potential future risks to forest carbon stocks and other benefits to ensure the efficiency and effectiveness of REDD+	No change
Criterion 16	Ensure consistency with and contribution to national poverty reduction strategies and other sustainable development goals (including those outlined under the Millennium Development Goals framework), including alignment with ministries' and sub-national strategies and plans that may have an impact on, or be affected by the forest sector and/or land use change	Ensure consistency with and contribution to national poverty reduction strategies and other sustainable development goals (including those outlined under the Millennium Development Goals framework), including alignment with ministries' and sub-national strategies and plans that may have an impact on, or be affected by the forest sector and/or land use change	No change
Criterion 17	Ensure consistency with and contribution to national biodiversity conservation policies, other environmental and natural	Ensure consistency with and contribution to national biodiversity conservation policies (including National Biodiversity	Addition of direct reference to National Biodiversity Strategies and Action Plans to emphasise linkage to Convention on Biological Diversity. Clarification that it is environmental

	resource management policy objectives, national forest programmes, and international commitments	Strategies and Action Plans), other environmental and natural resource management policy objectives, national forest programmes, and international commitments on the environment	commitments that are relevant to this Criterion.
Principle 5	Protect natural forest from degradation and/or conversion to other land uses, including plantation forest	Protect natural forest ⁸ from degradation and/or conversion	The revised principle addresses conversion and degradation of natural forest more generally, while criteria address specific types of conversion and degradation. Footnote added to indicate that the working definition for “natural forest” definition is the FAO definition for “naturally regenerated forest”. This may need to be revised if UNFCCC provides a definition of natural forest.
Criterion 18	Ensure that REDD+ activities do not cause the conversion of natural forest to other land uses, including plantation forest , and make reducing conversion due to other causes (e.g. agriculture, timber and fuelwood	Ensure that REDD+ activities do not cause the conversion of natural forest ⁹ , to planted forest, unless as part of forest restoration , and make reducing conversion of forests to other land uses (e.g. agriculture,	Planted forest’ substituted for ‘plantation forest’, because a more current and more precisely specified definition is available for the new term. Clarification that planting for restoration purposes is compatible with the Principle. Original definitions would have discouraged restoration of

⁸ This document uses the term “ natural forest “ synonymously with “ naturally regenerated forest “ as per definition provided by FAO.

⁹ *Ib idem.*

	extraction , infrastructure development) a REDD+ priority	infrastructure) a REDD+ priority	degraded natural forest. Removal of timber and fuelwood extraction as an example cause of conversion, as the result is still a natural forest, but a degraded one that is vulnerable to conversion. Also see Criterion 19.
Criterion 19	Minimise degradation of natural forest by REDD+ activities and make reducing degradation due to other causes (e.g. agriculture, timber and fuelwood extraction , infrastructure development) a REDD+ priority	Avoid or minimise degradation of natural forest ¹⁰ by REDD+ activities and make reducing degradation due to other causes (e.g. agriculture, extractive activities , infrastructure) a REDD+ priority	Inserted 'Avoid or...' to emphasise that it is desirable to avoid degradation – 'minimise' alone may have implied that it was an inevitable result. Degradation by REDD+ activities may result where the strategy for reducing deforestation involves increased extractive activities by local communities, so 'minimise' is still necessary. 'Timber and fuelwood extraction' replaced with 'extractive activities' to include other activities such as mining or hunting.
Criterion 20	Minimise indirect land-use change impacts of REDD+ activities on forest carbon stocks, biodiversity and other ecosystem services (including impacts of extractive activities)	Avoid or minimise indirect land-use change impacts of REDD+ activities on forest carbon stocks, biodiversity and other ecosystem services	Inserted 'Avoid or...' to emphasise that it is desirable to avoid indirect land-use change impacts. Removal of example of extractive activities, which is covered in BeRT .

¹⁰ *Ib idem.*

Principle 6	Maintain and enhance multiple functions of forest to deliver benefits including biodiversity conservation and ecosystem services	Maintain and enhance multiple functions of forest including conservation of biodiversity and provision of ecosystem services	Change in phrasing
Criterion 21	Ensure that land-use planning for REDD+ explicitly takes account of ecosystem services and biodiversity conservation in relation to local and other stakeholders' values, and potential synergies and trade-offs between different benefits	Ensure that land-use planning for REDD+ explicitly takes account of potential synergies and trade-offs between the multiple functions of forest and the benefits they provide, respecting local and other stakeholders' values	Change in phrasing, reflecting the definition of multiple functions of forest in the Principle as including biodiversity and ecosystem services
Criterion 22	Ensure that planted and natural forests are managed to maintain and enhance ecosystem services and biodiversity important in both local and national contexts	Ensure that planted and natural forests ¹¹ are managed to maintain and enhance ecosystem services and biodiversity important in both local and national contexts	No change
Principle 7	Minimise adverse impacts (direct and indirect) on non-forest ecosystem services and biodiversity	Avoid or minimise adverse impacts on non-forest ecosystem services and biodiversity	Inserted 'Avoid or...' to emphasise that it is desirable to avoid adverse impacts on non-forest ecosystems and their biodiversity. Removed 'direct and indirect' as these are covered

¹¹ *Ib idem.*

			in the Criteria
Criterion 23	Minimise adverse impacts on carbon stocks, biodiversity and other ecosystem services of non-forest ecosystems resulting directly from REDD+ activities (such as afforestation)	Avoid or minimise adverse impacts on carbon stocks, other ecosystem services and biodiversity of non-forest ecosystems resulting directly from REDD+ activities	<p>Inserted 'Avoid or...' to emphasise that it is desirable to avoid direct adverse impacts on non-forest ecosystems and their biodiversity.</p> <p>Changed order of 'other ecosystem services and biodiversity' to clarify that this intends 'other services than carbon'</p> <p>Removal of example, which is covered in BeRT</p>
Criterion 24	Minimise indirect land-use change impacts on carbon stocks, biodiversity and other ecosystem services of non-forest ecosystems (including impacts of extractive activities)	Avoid or minimise adverse impacts on carbon stocks, other ecosystem services and biodiversity of non-forest ecosystems resulting indirectly from REDD+ activities (including those of indirect land-use change impacts and intensification of land use)	<p>Merged with Criterion 25 below, bringing in intensification of land use.</p> <p>Inserted 'Avoid or...' to emphasise that it is desirable to avoid indirect adverse impacts on non-forest ecosystems and their biodiversity.</p> <p>Changed order of 'other ecosystem services and biodiversity' to clarify that this intends 'other services than carbon'</p>
Criterion 25	Minimise other adverse indirect impacts on biodiversity and carbon stocks of non-forest ecosystems, such as those resulting from intensification of land use	-	Integrated into Criterion 24 above

22 March 2012